Design and recruitment of a probability based CROss-National Online Survey (CRONOS) panel

Ana Villar, Elena Sommer, Didrik Finnøy, Bjørn-Ole Johannesen, Indrek Soidla, Alun Humphrey, Slavko Kurdija, Mare Ainsaar, Tina Vovk, Nejc Berzelak
CRONOS Core Team

• Central International Team
  • City, University of London (ESS HQ)
  • Norwegian Center for Research Data (ESS NSD)
  • University of Ljubljana (ESS UL)
  • Universitat Pompeu Fabra (ESS UPF)

• National Coordinator Teams
  • UK – NatCen Social Research
  • Slovenia – University of Ljubljana
  • Estonia – University of Tartu
Other CRONOS parties

- **CRONOS Advisory Board**
  - Michael Bosnjak (formerly GESIS Panel)
  - Mario Callegaro (Google)
  - Anne Cornilleau (ELIPSS Panel)
  - Salima Douhou (ESS, formerly LISS Panel)
  - Vasja Vehovar (University of Ljubljana)

- **Other SERISS partners**
  - GESIS (ESS)
  - European Values Study (EVS)
  - Munich Center for the Economics of Aging (MEA) (SHARE)
  - CentERdata (SHARE)

- **Questback GmbH (survey service provider)**

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 654221.
1. Introduction
Online panels

• **Opportunities**
  - Cost-efficient
  - Timely/regular/flexible data collection
  - Analytical: more data from same respondent

• **Challenges**
  - Sampling and representativeness
  - Low recruitment and participation rates
  - Panel attrition
  - Cross-national set up
Obtaining a probability sample

• Use existing surveys with probability samples
  • Relatively new for online panels
  • Cost reduction
  • Added burden on interviewers, respondents and fieldwork

• Allow those without internet to participate
  • Provide internet-enabled tablets
  • Recruitment questions to identify need
  • Arrange later delivery appointment and training
  • Instructions for persons delivering tablets
Setting up a cross-national online panel

• Recruit from existing cross-national survey with ‘input-harmonisation’ approach
  • ESS Round 8 (2016/17)

• Harmonise recruitment and panel maintenance strategies
  • Involve countries: meetings, draft sharing

• Centralised panel management and administration
  • Ethical issues
Country selection criteria

• Sufficient number of participants

• Sufficient country variation in terms of:
  • Response rate
  • Internet penetration
  • Type of survey organisation
  • Language

• Timely start of ESS Round 8 fieldwork
CRONOS countries

Internet use estimates from Eurostat 2016

- Estonia (1.3m) - 10%
- Great Britain (63.2m) - 22%
- Slovenia (2.1m) - 22%

Households with internet access:
- 86% (Estonia)
- 92% (Great Britain)
- 78% (Slovenia)
## CRONOS Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Estonia</th>
<th>Great Britain</th>
<th>Slovenia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sampling frame</strong></td>
<td>Population register</td>
<td>Sample of addresses</td>
<td>Population register</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESS Round 7 (2014)</strong></td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response Rate (RR1)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language</strong></td>
<td>Estonian, Russian</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Slovene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESS8 Fieldwork</strong></td>
<td>Statistical Office</td>
<td>Large non-profit organisation</td>
<td>University survey lab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CRONOS Management</strong></td>
<td>University research team</td>
<td>Large non-profit organisation</td>
<td>University survey lab</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Design & recruitment
Panel offer

• At the end of hour-long ESS Round 8 interview
• Six 20-minutes surveys over 12 months
• If no internet access: Internet-enabled tablet
• Unconditional incentive
  • £5/€5 per survey invitation
Recruitment procedure

• Plan: central + local input
  • Standardised recruitment interview
  • Produce protocols
• Train: local (according to protocols)
  • Interviewer briefings
  • Feedback workshops
• Implement: local
  • Additional questions with invitation to join the online panel at the end of the ESS Round 8 interview
• Monitor: local and central
3. Recruitment rates
Panel recruitment stages

ELIGIBLE PARTICIPANTS
Gross ESS8 Sample (18+, estimated)

- Estonia 2,998
- GB 4,655
- Slovenia 2,323

COMPLETED RECRUITMENT INTERVIEW
ESS8 18+ respondents

INITIAL AGREEMENT TO JOIN PANEL
Panel recruitment stages

**ELIGIBLE PARTICIPANTS**
- Gross ESS8 Sample (18+, estimated)
  - Estonia: 2,998
  - GB: 4,655
  - Slovenia: 2,323

**COMPLETED RECRUITMENT INTERVIEW**
- ESS8 18+ respondents
  - Estonia: 1,948 (65%)
  - GB: 1,783 (38%)
  - Slovenia: 1,255 (54%)

**INITIAL AGREEMENT TO JOIN PANEL**
- Estonia: 1,149 (38%)
- GB: 1,206 (26%)
- Slovenia: 808 (35%)

**PANELLISTS INVITED TO WAVE 1**
## Recruitment

Percentage of all eligible ESS8 respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Initial agreement</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Hesitant</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>808</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Participation rates
Welcome survey

• Goal – engage panellists recruited at earlier stage of recruitment
• 10 minutes
• First batch sent out in December 2016
• Not all panellists invited, number of reminders varies between batches
### Welcome survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Invited N</th>
<th>Completed N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>843</td>
<td>596</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>1206</td>
<td>461</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>732</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*As of 16.03.2017. Survey still in field. Panellists provided a tablet will participate until late March 2017.
Wave 1

- Sent out on 27 (Estonia & UK)/28 (Slovenia) February 2017
- Still in field, numbers are preliminary as of 16.03.2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Invited Feb 2017*</th>
<th>Completed so far</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>928</td>
<td>883</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>1203</td>
<td>1082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>791</td>
<td>735</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Panellists provided with a tablet in all countries as well as panellists who did not provided an email address in the UK will be invited to Wave 1 in late March 2017.
5. Lessons learned so far
Cross-national set up

• High levels of input harmonisation entail high levels of central and local resources

• Cross-national challenges
  • Harmonisation (e.g. fieldwork dates, consent procedures, delivery of incentive)
  • Establishing communication strategies across different types (and size) of survey organisation

• Consent for cross-border transfer of personal information to NSD and Questback
Recruitment and participation rates

• Initial agreement rates are relatively high
• Actual survey participation varies across countries
• Those without internet more difficult to recruit
THANKS

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 654221.
Panel recruitment stages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Eligible Participants</th>
<th>Completed Recruitment Interview</th>
<th>Initial Agreement to Join Panel</th>
<th>Panellists Invited to Wave 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>2,998</td>
<td>1,948 (65%)</td>
<td>1,149 (38%)</td>
<td>928 (31%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>4,655</td>
<td>1,783 (38%)</td>
<td>1,206 (26%)</td>
<td>1,203 (26%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>2,323</td>
<td>1,255 (54%)</td>
<td>808 (35%)</td>
<td>791 (34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9,976</td>
<td>4,986 (50%)</td>
<td>3,163 (32%)</td>
<td>2,912 (29%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ineligible respondents not yet excluded from denominator in outcome rate calculations*
## Incentives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INCENTIVES</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Type of incentive</th>
<th>Delivery</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>€10</td>
<td>Every other wave</td>
<td>Supermarket voucher</td>
<td>E-mail invitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>€10</td>
<td>Every other wave</td>
<td>Supermarket voucher</td>
<td>Postal pre-notification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK - planned</td>
<td>£5</td>
<td>Every wave</td>
<td>Amazon voucher</td>
<td>E-mail invitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK – Group 1</td>
<td>£5</td>
<td>Every wave</td>
<td>Love2shop voucher</td>
<td>Postal pre-notification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK – Group 2</td>
<td>£30</td>
<td>One: with first wave</td>
<td>Love2shop voucher</td>
<td>Postal pre-notification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Panel basic demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Estonia</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Great Britain</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Slovenia</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pop.</td>
<td>ESS 18+</td>
<td>CRONOS</td>
<td>Pop.</td>
<td>ESS 18+</td>
<td>CRONOS</td>
<td>Pop.</td>
<td>ESS 18+</td>
<td>CRONOS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>+6</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>+4</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>+6</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td>-5</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>+6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>+2</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>+4</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71+</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>+3</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>+5</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# Panel basic demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Estonia</th>
<th>Great Britain</th>
<th>Slovenia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CRONOS</td>
<td>ESS 18+</td>
<td>Pop.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71+</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ESS data from ESS Round 7 (2012)
Tablets

Estonia: 46 panellists (5%)
GB: 82 panellists (7%)
Slovenia: 52 panellists (7%)

- Set-up by NCs
- Delivery and training by briefed interviews