

Using paradata to monitor interviewers' instrument navigation behavior and inform instrument technical design: A case study from a national household survey in Ghana

Yu-chieh (Jay) Lin , Kyle Kwaiser, Gina-Qian Cheung, & Jennifer Kelley,

Chicago July 25-29, 2016

The 2nd International Conference on Survey Methods in Multinational, Multiregional and Multicultural Contexts (3MC)

© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan



Overview

- Background and instrument
- How does the instrument <u>design</u> affect instrument <u>navigation</u> by the interviewers?
- How does instrument <u>navigation</u> affect interview <u>length</u>?

Some observations & next steps



- Revisit panel households at 3-4 year intervals for 20 years.
 - Sponsored by Economic Growth Center (EGC) at Yale University
 - Carried out by the Institute for Statistical, Social and Economic Research (ISSER) at the University of Ghana.
- First wave (baseline) was completed on *paper* between October 2009 and February 2010.
- Second wave was conducted on *Computer-Assisted Personal Interviewing (CAPI)* between March-December 2014.
 Collaborated with Survey Research Center (SRC) at University of Michigan.
- 334 enumeration areas country-wide. Sample size of 5009 households, with approximately 18,000 individuals. Also sample size of 500 split-off households were tracked and interviewed between January-June 2015.
- Interviews are NOT digital recorded for quality monitor purpose

NSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH

IVEY RESEARCH CENTER







© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan



Challenges from Paper to CAI

- Transition from complex grid designs on paper to a computer assisted interview (CAI) instrument.
- Need to have total <u>flexibility</u> to jump in/out from different sections of the instrument (depending on the availability of the respondents)
- Need to track <u>real-time status</u> of interviewing progress on multiple respondents within the same instrument.



Section 1: Household Information

Part B2: Household Roster

Part B2: Household Roster

Member ID	6a. Name	6b. Nicknames, Other Names	7. Sex (M/F)	8. Age (If age less <1, record 0)	 Relationship to HH Head (see codes to the right of the page) 	10. Marital Status (see codes)	11. Current Cell Phone Number	CODES FOR Q.9 1 – Household Head
1								2 – Spouse 3 – Child
2								4 - Grandchild 5 - Parent/ Parent-in-
3								law 6 – Son/Daughter-in-lav
4								7 – Other relative 8 – Adopted/Foster/
5								Stepchild 9 – House belo
6								10 – Non-relative
7								
8								CODES FOR Q.10
9								1 – Never Married 2 - Consensual union
10								3 – Betrothed 4 – Married
11								5 - Separated 6 - Divorced
12								7 - Widowed
13								
14								
15								
16								
17								
18								
19								
20								
21								
22								
23								
24								
25								

Household Roster



INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH SURVEY RESEARCH CENTER

Section	2. members of the	нн	3. HH asse	ts	4. HH p	oroduction	5. non-farm enter	orise	11. consum	nption module
1. Who in the household is most knowledgeable about?	family history, relat spouses that don't household	ives and live in	land holding animals, fin household d	gs, farm tools, ancial assets, durables	plots, c village	rops, interaction with officials/ organizations	non-farm business ventures, costs, rev employees, assets	/enues,	how much fe eats, house	ood the family hold bills
2. Name										
3. ID number	IDI		ID	1	ID	l		1	ID	
4. Date & time for										
Individual Interview: dd.mm / time)	IDI		IDI		ID]	IDI	IDI		
5. Checkpoint: Interview Complete?	- ll/l	I	_!/1	II/I]	I/I	II/I	I	_I/I	
1. Yes 2. No Initials and date when the interview was completed interview was completed	l		I	l		l	1		I	

(ii.) Limited respondent Modules Enumerator: each of the following sections must be asked to the head of the household, the spouse, and one person RANDOMLY chosen. Please schedule an interview date with these selected household members. Record your initials date and when the interview was completed. 1. Write the names on pieces of papers for the household head to select:

Section 10. Psych/Personality	Head	Spouse	Randomly chosen individual
6. ID number	II	I	L 0
7. Name			
8. Date & time for Individual Interview : dd.mm/time	II	II	I/I/I
9. Checkpoint: Section 10, Psychology/Personality complete? 1. Yes 2. No Initials and date when the interview was]]
completed			





Consent Has Completed

1	Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\householdsurvey		
	Forms Answer Help		
	HOUSEHOLD SURVEY		
	Survey Status		
	SOConsent Forms S01A: Consent Done	S01B3: Consent for Under 26n/a	
	Rosters S01B2: Household Roster Not Sta	arted	
	Not all sections have been completed! Please select a section a	and continue the survey.	
	Case Complete		
	iwcomplete 101012055	iwcomplete	



Household Roster Has Completed

Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\housel	noldsurvey		
Forms Answer Help			
HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status			
Survey Status			
Survey Status			
SOConsent Forms			
S01A: Consent	Done	S01B3: Consent for Under 26	Not Started
Rosters			
S01B2: Household Roster	Done	Person Sections	Not Started
S04: Plot Roster	Not Started	Plot Sections	n/a
S05: Non-Farm Enterprise Roster	Not Started	Non-Farm Enterprise Sections	n/a
Henry held I and Continue			
Household Level Sections		602 A .: A .: I	
SU2B: Non-Resident Spouses	Not Started	SU3AI: Animais	Not Started
S02A: Non-Resident Relatives	Not Started	S03Aii: Tools	Not Started
S10C: Social Networking	Not Started	SO3Aiii: Durable Goods	Not Started
S10D: Information Seeking	Not Started	SO3Bi: Borrowing	Not Started
S11: Household Consumption	Not Started	S03Bii: Lending	Not Started
S12: Housing Characteristics	Not Started	S03Biii: Out-Transfers	n/a
SO4NN: Gathering	Not Started	S03Biv: In-Transfers	n/a
		SO3Bv: Savings	Not Started



INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH SURVEY RESEARCH CENTER

l	Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\wo	ork\householdsurvey		
	Forms Answer Help			
	HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status			
	Name Backgro	und Employment Education N	ligration Health Womens Health	Mens Health Children Pysch/Social
	SAMUEL KANGA SNR (SNR) SAMUEL KANGA JNR (JNR) Not Sta RAMAT DOMSON NENYA HANGAH Not Sta	irted Not Started	Not Started Not Started n/a Not Not Started Not Started n/a Not Not Started Not Started n/a Not Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Not Started Not Started Not Not	Started n/a Not Started Started n/a Not Started /a n/a Not Started /a Not Started Not Started Started Not Started Not Started
	Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_b\work\hous	eholdsurvey		
	Forms Answer Help			
	HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status			
I				
	Survey Status			
	SUConsent Forms	Dama	CO1D2: Concept for Up does	26 Net Granted
	SUIA: Consent	Done	SUIDS: Consent for Under	20 Not Started
	Rosters			
	S01B2: Household Roster	Done	Person Sections	Not Started
	S04: Plot Roster	Not Started	Plot Sections	n/a
	S05: Non-Farm Enterprise Roster	Not Started	Non-Farm Enterprise Secti	onsn/a
	Household Level Sections			
	S02B: Non-Resident Spouses	Not Started	S03Ai: Animals	Not Started
	S02A: Non-Resident Relatives	Not Started	SO3Aii: Tools	Not Started
	S10C: Social Networking	Not Started	SO3Aiii: Durable Goods	Not Started
	S10D: Information Seeking	Not Started	S03Bi: Borrowing	Not Started
	S11: Household Consumption	Not Started	SO3Bii: Lending	Not Started
	S12: Housing Characteristics	Not Started	S03Biii: Out-Transfers	n/a
	S04NN: Gathering	Not Started	S03Biv: In-Transfers	n/a
	Ĭ		SO3Bv: Savings	Not Started





Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\householdsurvey

Forms Answer Help
HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status

Survey Status

SOConsent Forms

S01A: Consent	Done	S01B3: Consent for Under 26	Not Started
Rosters			
S01B2: Household Roster	Done	Person Sections	Not Started
S04: Plot Roster	Done	Plot Sections	n/a
S05: Non-Farm Enterprise Roster	Done	Non-Farm Enterprise Sections	n/a
Household Level Sections			
S02B: Non-Resident Spouses	Not Started	S03Ai: Animals	Not Started
S02A: Non-Resident Relatives	Not Started	S03Aii: Tools	Not Started
S10C: Social Networking	Not Started	S03Aiii: Durable Goods	Not Started
S10D: Information Seeking	Not Started	S03Bi: Borrowing	Not Started
S11: Household Consumption	Not Started	S03Bii: Lending	Not Started
S12: Housing Characteristics	Not Started	SO3Biii: Out-Transfers	n/a
S04NN: Gathering	Not Started	S03Biv: In-Transfers	n/a
		SO3Bv: Savings	Not Started

Not all sections have been completed! Please select a section and continue the survey.

Case Complete	nplete
---------------	--------

- 0 - X









S11: Household Consumption S12: Housing Characteristics S04NN: Gathering

Not Started Not Started Not Started SO3Bv: Savings

S03Bi: Borrowing SO3Bii: Lending S03Biii: Out-Transfers S03Biv: In-Transfers

Not Started

----n/a----

----n/a----

Not Started

|--|





	Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blprc			
	Forms Answer Help			
	HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Perso	on Status Enterprise Status Agriculture		
	Name	Background Employment Education N	ligration Health Womens Health Mens Health C	children Pysch/Social
	ADAM K (AK AMINA A (MINA) ABDULA TANCIDOW A JUSSIF A LAILATU A	Started Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Mot Started Not Started No	Started n/a Not Started Jot Started Not Started Not Started Jot Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Jot Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Jot Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Started Not Started	Not Started n/a Not Started n/a Not Started lot Started n/a lot Started n/a lot Started n/a
👔 Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\	househoiasurvey			
Forms Answer Help				
HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status Enter	rprise Status Agriculture			
Survey Status				
SOConsent Forms				
S01A: Consent	Done	S01B3: Consent for Under 26	Done	
Rosters				
S01B2: Household Roster	Done	Person Sections	Started	
S04: Plot Roster	Done	Plot Sections	Done	
S05: Non-Farm Enterprise Roster	Done	Non-Farm Enterprise Sections	Not Started	
Household Level Sections				
S02B: Non-Besident Shouses	Not Started	SO3Ai: Animals	Done	
S02A: Non-Resident Relatives	Not Started	SO3Aii: Tools	Started	
S10C: Social Networking	Started	S03Aiii: Durable Goods	Started	
S10D: Information Seeking	Done	S03Bi: Borrowing	Not Started	
S11: Household Consumption	Not Started	S03Bii: Lending	Done	
S12: Housing Characteristics	Not Started	S03Biii: Out-Transfers	n/a	
S04NN: Gathering	Done	S03Biv: In-Transfers	p/a	
		S03Bv: Savings	Done	
		0000110011180		



"Master" Dashboard

Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\h	Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\householdsurvey						
Forms Answer Help							
HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status Enter	orise Status Agriculture						
Survey Status							
SOConsent Forms							
S01A: Consent	Done	S01B3: Consent for Under 26	Not Started				
Rosters							
S01B2: Household Roster	Done	Person Sections	Not Started				
S04: Plot Roster	Done	Plot Sections	Not Started				
S05: Non-Farm Enterprise Roster	Done	Non-Farm Enterprise Sections	Not Started				
Household Level Sections							
S02B: Non-Resident Spouses	Not Started	S03Ai: Animals	Not Started				
S02A: Non-Resident Relatives	Not Started	S03Aii: Tools	Not Started				
S10C: Social Networking	Not Started	SO3Aiii: Durable Goods	Not Started				
S10D: Information Seeking	Not Started	S03Bi: Borrowing	Not Started				
S11: Household Consumption	Not Started	SO3Bii: Lending	Not Started				
S12: Housing Characteristics	Not Started	S03Biii: Out-Transfers	n/a				
S04NN: Gathering	Not Started	S03Biv: In-Transfers	n/a				
		SO3Bv: Savings	Not Started				



"Benefits" of this design

Iwers have a high-level of autonomy with respect to <u>interview navigation</u>.

Iwers are able to:

- switch respondents easily.
- \succ jump to any section of questionnaire quickly.

Development of a questionnaire "<u>Dashboard</u>" to show the status of all the questionnaire sections and all the respondents within the household.



Questions for the design...

- How does instrument <u>design</u> affect instrument <u>navigation</u>?
 - Instrument parallel blocks: four instruments (household, personal, agriculture, enterprise) with multiple sections/blocks within each instrument.
- How does instrument <u>navigation</u> affect interview <u>length</u>?
 Order of interview initiation
 - Movements between blocks

By using keystroke data (Paradata)







Most Common Block Moves All Types

- Edge Weight (number of times a move occurred) >= 500
- Movement within sections dominates
- Exceptions are rosters and Personal to Household





Blaise 4.8 Data Entry - c:\blproj\ghana_p\work\householdsurvey

Forms Answer Help

HOUSEHOLD SURVEY Person Status Enterprise Status Agriculture

Name	Background	Employment	Education	Migration	Health	Womens Hea	Ith Mens Health	Children	Pysch/Social
ADAM K (AK)	Started	Done	Done	Done	Started	n/a	Not Started	n/a	Not Started
AMINA A (MINA)	Not Started	n/a	n/a	Not Started					
ABDUL A	Not Started	n/a	Not Started	n/a	Not Started				
TANLIDOW A	Not Started	n/a	n/a	Not Started	n/a				
YUSSIF A	Done	n/a	Not Started	n/a	Not Started	n/a	n/a	Not Started	n/a
LAILATU A	Done	n/a	n/a	n/a	Not Started	n/a	n/a	Not Started	n/a

Most Common Block Moves All Types

> Tendency to move laterally or within the same questionnaire content

> Optional sections introduce multiple, common paths





Most Common Block Moves All Types

- Tendency to work down the columns
- Non-resident Relatives and Consumption introduce multiple common paths





Moving Out of a Section

- > Type 4 interviews showing moves out of the Enterprise section
- "fourImportant" block has most exit moves



Instrument Parallel Blocks

- We should have some instructions about the <u>optimal</u> <u>interviewing paths</u> for the desired navigation
 - The parallel blocks <u>programming</u> needs to match with the optimal navigation design
 - The interviewer training needs to emphasize the design and avoid "jump around too much"

How does instrument <u>navigation</u> affect interview <u>length</u>?
 Order of interview initiation
 Movements between blocks



N = 4223 interviews

- Type 1) Personal + Household
- Type 2) Personal + Household + Plot
- Type 3) Personal + Household + Enterprise
- Type 4) Personal + Household + Plot + Enterprise

Interview Length

- Adjusted mean 290 (+/- 156) minutes
- Ranged from ~30 minutes to 22 hours
- Type 4 longer than all others (P<0.05)
- Type 1 shorter than all others (P<0.05)
- Type 2 & 3 not different





Rosters-first group showed • significantly lower interview lengths

- Ave Roster First: 257.3 •
- Ave Others: 280.3 ٠
- P < .0001 ٠



Order of Section Entry

RSITY OF MICHIGAN

INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH

Split sample into two groups: •

SURVEY RESEARCH CENTER

- **Completed rosters first** •
- Others
- T-test comparison of IW •



Distribution of IW_LENGTH_MIN_ADJ



31



Some Observations (Roster-First)

> Region (10):

> Only 2 regions; no significant differences in four regions.

➤ HH Type (1-4):

> Only HH without any or with both agriculture/enterprises sections.

➤ HH size (1-17):

Single-person HH; no significant differences in HH size = 2 or 3.

> Team leadership (23):

Only in 8 teams; no significant differences in 4 teams.



Number of Block Moves Per Block

- On a per household basis
- Average 52 blocks per household
- Average Block Moves per Block is 1.21
- Min = 1, Max = 2.82 (for all types)



Number of Block Moves Per Block by Interview Type

Differences by Interview Type

- Less movement in Type 2 (Plot only, P<.05)
- Type 3 (Enterprise only) more movement than Type 1/2 (P < 0.05), trending toward more than Type 4



33



Interview Length & Number Block Moves Per Block

- Interview length increases with increasing movement between blocks
- IW Length = 80.6 * MovesPerBlock
 + 216
- P = .028; R² = 0.302; Adj R² = 0.255
- Non-linear relationship?







Interview Length & Number of Block Moves Per Section

Number interviews ranges from N = 1277 to 2 Interviews are clustered under 1.5 Block Moves Per Section



Interview Length & Number Block Moves Per Block By Type



^{© 2016} by the Regents of the University of Michigan



Some Observations (Block Moves)

- Movement between blocks are with a <u>cost</u>
- Interview <u>length</u> increases with increasing movement between blocks
- Some movements are explainable with the instrument design but others are unsure --- why



What else we look into?

- Other paradata usage examples:
 - ➢By block
 - ≻By Iwer
 - ➢ By question
 - ➢ By respondent
 - ≻By time/Iw order

© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan



Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exits_by_blk) for specific blocks Data represent blocks with > 75 total exits and a mid-block exit rate >= 25%.



INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH

SITY OF MICHIGAN

JRVEY RESEARCH CENTER



Midblock Exits (by block by person)

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exits_by_blk) for specific, ennumerated blocks Larger bubbles indicate more exit events.





Midblock Exits – Overall (by Iwer)

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exits_by_blk) on a per-IWER basis Data represent IWERs with > 75 total exits





Midblock Exits (by Iwer) - Consumption

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exit_iwer_blk) per IWER for the s11_consumption block Data represent IWERs with > 20 total exits





Midblock Exits (by Iwer) - Health

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exit_iwer_blk) per IWER for the s06_health[1] block Data represent IWERs with > 20 total exits





Midblock Exits (by Iwer) - Housing

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exit_iwer_blk) per IWER for the s12_housing block Data represent IWERs with > 20 total exits





Midblock Exits (by Iwer) – HH Roster

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exit_iwer_blk) per IWER for the s01b2_householdroster block Data represent IWERs with > 20 total exits





Midblock Exits (by Iwer) – Non Resident Relatives

Midblock exits divided by total exits (ratio_midblk_exit_iwer_blk) per IWER for the s02a_nr_relatives block Data represent IWERs with > 20 total exits





QC – Quick Read



© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan



Average # of Questions Read < 1 second by the Iw Order





QC – Response Changes

Response changes divided by total responses (ratio_resp_chg_by_blk) for specific blocks Data represent blocks with > 100 responses and a response change rate >= 3%.



SURVEY RESEARCH CENTER Average # of Response Changes by the Iw Order



© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan

TE FOR SOCIAL RESEARCH



Next Steps

Link the block movement data with interviewer level.

- Identify "sensitive" QC indicators (e.g., data discrepancies).
- > Who answered the Iw.
- > Interviewers debriefing.

Apply all the lessons we learned in this wave to next wave instrument design



Acknowledgements

Contributors from Yale University and Institute for Statistical, Social and Economic Research (ISSER) at the University of Ghana

University of Michigan

Project staff: Beth-Ellen Pennell, Gina-Qian Cheung, Yu-Chieh (Jay) Lin, Lisa Wood, Joel Devonshire, Jennie Williams, Xuetao (Brant) Zhang, Kyle S. Kwaiser

> Analysis funding: U-M Survey Research Operations



Thank You!

Contact info: yuchiehl@umich.edu

© 2016 by the Regents of the University of Michigan