

Qualitative Research on Questions of Race, Tribe Identification, and Tribal Enrollment for Multicultural American Indians

**Rodney L. Terry, Leticia Fernandez,
Laurie Schwede, and Aleia Clark Fobia**

Center for Survey Measurement

U.S. Census Bureau

3MC Conference

07-28-16



U.S. Department of Commerce
Economics and Statistics Administration
U.S. CENSUS BUREAU
census.gov

Disclaimer: Any views expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the U.S. Census Bureau.

Overview

- Background
 - Measuring American Indian race in the U.S.
- Method
 - Three qualitative pretesting studies on new ways to collect:
 - American Indian race and tribe data
 - American Indian tribal enrollment data
- Results
 - Reactions to race category and tribe write-in line instruction formats
 - Opinions on tribal enrollment topics
- Discussion



American Indian Race Measurement

- American Indian race measurement is complex.
 - It has additional measurement of tribal affiliation or community attachment (Office of Management and Budget, 1997)
 - Several factors affect measurement, including:
 - a great diversity of U.S. tribes
 - tribal enrollment, which can confound with AIAN tribe identification



Purpose

- Discuss Census Bureau efforts to explore new ways to collect race and tribe information from American Indians
- Findings from three questionnaire pretests (Schwede, Terry, & Fernandez, 2015; Terry, Schwede, Fernandez, & Fobia 2016; Terry, Schwede, & Fobia, 2015)
 - New AIAN race reporting checkboxes and write-in instructions
 - Designed to improve race and tribe reporting for the 2020 Census
 - New, separate, and specific tribal enrollment question
 - Designed to better express tribal enrollment status



Method

	2015 Cognitive Test	2014 Focus Groups	2016 Focus Groups
Focus Groups/ Interviews	7 cognitive interviews	2 groups in 2 sites	9 focus groups in 9 sites
Participant Total	7	16	67
Test Focus	AIAN category detailed checkboxes	AIAN category write-in instructions	Tribal enrollment question
Recruitment Focus	Tribe diversity Tribe recognition status	Breadth of tribe representation at a National Conference Urban Indians	Tribe diversity Tribe recognition status Geographic diversity

2015 Cognitive Interviews: AIAN detailed checkboxes



U.S. Department of Commerce
Economics and Statistics Administration
U.S. CENSUS BUREAU
census.gov

Forms Tested: 2015 Cognitive Interviews

- “Which categories describe Person 1 question” wording
- Checkboxes for main OMB categories + MENA and SOR
- Checkboxes for nationalities and ethnic groups of each main category
- Write-in space with examples for each main category

8. Which categories describe Person 1? Mark all boxes that apply AND print details in the spaces below. Note, you may report more than one group.

WHITE – Provide details below.

German Irish English
 Italian Polish French
Print, for example, Scottish, Norwegian, Dutch, etc. ?

HISPANIC, LATINO, OR SPANISH ORIGIN – Provide details below.

Mexican or Mexican American Puerto Rican Cuban
 Salvadoran Dominican Colombian
Print, for example, Guatemalan, Spaniard, Ecuadorian, etc. ?

BLACK OR AFRICAN AM. – Provide details below.

African American Jamaican Haitian
 Nigerian Ethiopian Somalian
Print, for example, Ghanaian, South African, Barbadian, etc. ?

ASIAN – Provide details below.

Chinese Filipino Asian Indian
 Vietnamese Korean Japanese
Print, for example, Pakistani, Cambodian, Hmong, etc. ?

AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE – Provide details below.

American Indian Alaska Native Central or South American Indian
Print, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat, Nome Eskimo Community, etc. ?

MIDDLE EASTERN OR NORTH AFRICAN – Provide details below.

Lebanese Iranian Egyptian
 Syrian Moroccan Algerian
Print, for example, Israeli, Iraqi, Tunisian, etc. ?

NATIVE HAWAIIAN OR PACIFIC ISLANDER – Provide details below.

Native Hawaiian Samoan Chamorro
 Tongan Fijian Marshallese
Print, for example, Palauan, Tahitian, Chuukese, etc. ?

SOME OTHER RACE, ETHNICITY, OR ORIGIN – Print below. ?

8. Which categories describe Person 1? Mark all boxes that apply AND print details in the spaces below. Note, you may report more than one group.

WHITE – Provide details below.

German Irish English
 Italian Polish French
Print, for example, Scottish, Norwegian, Dutch, etc. ?

HISPANIC, LATINO, OR SPANISH ORIGIN – Provide details below.

Mexican or Mexican American Puerto Rican Cuban
 Salvadoran Dominican Colombian
Print, for example, Guatemalan, Spaniard, Ecuadorian, etc. ?



Forms Tested: 2015 Cognitive Interviews

FORM

W1

AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE – *Provide details below.*

American Indian Alaska Native Central or South American Indian

Print, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat, Nome Eskimo Community, etc. ¶

W2

AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE

American Indian Alaska Native Central or South American Indian

Print, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat, Nome Eskimo Community, etc. ¶

W3

AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE – *Provide details below.*

Navajo Nation Blackfeet Tribe Mayan

Aztec Native Village of Barrow Inupiat Nome Eskimo Community

Print, for example, Muscogee (Creek) Nation, Taino, Orutsararmuit Native Village, etc. ¶

Three broad AIAN detailed categories

vs.

Six specific AIAN detailed categories



Findings:

2015 Cognitive Interviews

- All were able to understand the question and give an answer with little to no difficulty
- Race/ethnicity detailed checkboxes and examples
 - Having only Blackfeet and Navajo tribes as the checkbox tribes seemed unfair to other tribes.



Findings:

2015 Cognitive Interviews

- AIAN category design preference
 - All preferred three broad detailed category design
 - Respondents appreciated fairness shown to all AIANs.
 - Starting broad and then getting specific with the write-in space fit how respondents thought about their race/ethnic identity.

AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE – *Provide details below.*

American Indian Alaska Native Central or South American Indian

Print, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat, Nome Eskimo Community, etc. ?



2014 Focus Groups: AIAN write-in line instructions



U.S. Department of Commerce
Economics and Statistics Administration
U.S. CENSUS BUREAU
census.gov

Forms Tested: 2014 Focus Groups

	Form 1	Forms 2 - 6
Question Stem	Which Categories Describe You?	What is your race or origin?
AIAN Category Write-In Instruction	1. Print, for example,...	2. Print name of enrolled or principal tribe(s) 3. Print name(s) or enrolled or affiliated tribe(s) 4. Print name(s) of affiliated tribe(s) 5. Print name(s) of tribe(s) or village(s) 6. Print specific origin(s)
Write-in Examples	Navajo Nation, Muscogee (Creek) Nation, Mayan, Doyon, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat Traditional Government	



Results: 2014 Focus Groups

Topic	Finding
Overarching Themes	Complex relationships to tribes may complicate tribe reporting. Respondents unclear about what information is wanted.
Write-in Instructions	Respondents interpreted each format differently but felt they could give a valid answer to each format.



Results: 2014 Focus Groups

Topic	Finding
Write-in Examples	Objections were about personal tribes not listed.
Instruction Preferences	1. Enrolled or affiliated tribe(s) 2. Enrolled or principal tribe(s)
Respondent Recommendations	Educate public on specific information wanted. Consider a separate enrollment question.



2016 Focus Groups: Tribal Enrollment Question



U.S. Department of Commerce
Economics and Statistics Administration
U.S. CENSUS BUREAU
census.gov

Results: 2016 Focus Groups

Topic	Finding
Meaning of Enrollment	<p>Enrollment criteria and privileges vary greatly by tribe</p> <p>Enrollment status can change</p>
Should the Census Bureau Collect Enrollment Question Data?	<p>Views were highly mixed</p> <p>Advantage: Perceived to better identify the enrolled AIAN population</p> <p>Disadvantages: Would exclude American Indians who are not enrolled; How data would be used is unclear; Based solely on self-identification</p>



Results: 2016 Focus Groups

Topic		
	Format 1	Format 2
Preferred Sample Enrollment Question Formats	<p>On April 1st, was Person 1 enrolled in a tribe?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No, not enrolled</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, enrolled – Print enrolled tribe(s) below.</p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; height: 47px; width: 372px; margin-top: 10px;"></div>	<p>On April 1st, was Person 1 enrolled in a tribe?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No, not enrolled</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, enrolled – Print enrolled tribe below.</p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; height: 47px; width: 409px; margin-top: 10px;"></div> <p>Is the tribe above federally recognized, state-recognized, or non-recognized?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, federally-recognized</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, state-recognized</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, non-recognized</p>



Discussion

- American Indian race and tribe data collection
 - Focus on clarity and fairness
 - A shared understanding of wording is essential
 - Disentangle issues of enrollment
- American Indian enrollment data collection
 - Aim for simplicity
 - Understand the pros and cons of enrollment data collection



Discussion

- Implications for multicultural and multiregional research
 - Social, political, and historical context are important factors
 - Experiences can differ geographically
- Next steps
 - AIAN detailed checkboxes and write-in instructions
 - Analyze national, split-ballot test results
 - Enrollment question
 - Cognitive test
 - Split-ballot national test



Thank you!

Qualitative Research on Questions of Race, Tribe Identification, and Tribal Enrollment for Multicultural American Indians

Rodney.Terry@census.gov

Leticia.Esther.Fernandez@census.gov

Laurel.K.Schwede@census.gov

Aleia.Yvonne.Clark.Fobia@census.gov

